

Buncombe County Planning and Development Long Range Planning Division 46 Valley St. Asheville, NC 28801

SHORT-TERM RENTAL TEXT AMENDMENTS MEMORANDUM

Original Date:	12-1-2023
Updated:	1-12-2024
То:	Buncombe County Planning Board
From:	Buncombe County Planning and Development Department

PURPOSE

The Short-Term Rental (STR) Memorandum provides an overview of key issues and proposed Zoning Ordinance changes related to short-term rentals in Buncombe County. The working definition of STR is any lodging rental that is for less than 30 days. The current Buncombe County Zoning Ordinance defines "vacation rentals", but these can also be referred to as "short-term rentals". This document will summarize an analysis of equity issues, relevant case law, current bills before the General Assembly, a consideration of regulations in other jurisdictions, and proposed text amendments.

EQUITY ANALYSIS

Planning staff are proposing a series of text amendments to the current zoning ordinance regarding STRs. These text amendments seek to mitigate the impact of STRs on affordable housing stock by limiting the use of existing and future residential development for STRs. The goal is to create more long-term rental and owner-occupied housing opportunities for residents and the local workforce.

During the extensive public input process of the Buncombe 2043 Comprehensive Plan, residents, including historically marginalized groups, expressed concerns about the lack of housing affordability and the use of housing as STRs, which leaves fewer options for year-round residents.

The changes in these text amendments will affect low and middle-income renters, home buyers, and local workers by seeking to make more housing stock available for long-term rentals and owner-occupied housing. According to a 2021 Dogwood Health Trust study, Buncombe County's long-term rental housing gap was 7,699 units, while the housing ownership gap was 2,048 units.¹ Individuals and families earning less than or equal to

¹ Bowen National Research. (2021). Housing Needs Assessment Western North Carolina. https://dogwoodhealthtrust.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/Western-North-Carolina-Hsg-Needs-Assmt.pdf

50% AMI make up 70% of the housing gaps (both rental and home ownership); therefore, the loss of housing to short-term rentals uniquely affects Buncombe's low-income population.

Using AirDNA, a software company that provides analysis of vacation rental data, our Comprehensive Plan consulting firm Clarion & Associates identified 5,268 STRs in Buncombe as of 2022, which is roughly 4.5% of the county's housing stock. These rentals account for around 68% of the rental housing gap of 7,699 units. By limiting the amount of housing used for STRs, the County can work towards closing the long-term rental and homeownership gaps outlined in the Dogwood Study. Allowing STRs only within detached single-family dwellings can also help reduce conflict related to noise and safety that can be exacerbated in multi-family developments. Multi-family units also tend to be more affordable types of housing. Without these proposed text amendments, the County may be unable to minimize the ongoing loss of long-term rental and owner-occupied dwelling units to STRs.

The proposed text amendments aim to prioritize existing and new long-term housing stock. To measure the success of these Zoning Ordinance changes, staff will use the performance metrics from the Buncombe 2043 Comprehensive Plan. These metrics will measure the increase in the number of ownership units and rental units which are affordable to households earning less than 80% Average Median Income (AMI).

CASE LAW

Schroeder v. Wilmington

A 2019 amendment to G.S. 42A-3 clarified that housing code inspection, permits, and registration (IPR) programs apply to properties subject to the Vacation Rental Act (VRA), which was written with long-term rentals in mind but also includes most if not all STRs. The North Carolina Court of Appeals ruled that, per state law, local governments may not require registration or permits <u>as a condition of renting</u>. However, general land use zoning authority is retained: <u>you may require a zoning compliance permit but not a leasing/rental permit</u>. Many regulatory provisions in the Wilmington ordinance were upheld by the ruling while others were struck down simply because they were intertwined with the registration requirement. Density caps on rental units and requirements that the rentals be separated by a certain distance from each other are two issues that may be problematic. Both were among those struck down due to the relationship with the registration requirements of the Wilmington ordinance but are likely achievable through conventional zoning methods, which begin with defining short-term rentals as a land use. *For more information, see the October 2022 memo prepared by Clarion Associates, as well as the summary by Adam Lovelady from UNC School of Government on the Coates' Canons law blog.*

STR REGULATION IN OTHER JURISDICTIONS

This is a curated look at STR regulations from other counties and local governments in the state (generally and in response to *Schroeder*), including examples from other localities outside of North Carolina. <u>Please note, the</u> <u>examples from other states may not be allowed by North Carolina General Statute, but are presented to illustrate a variety of approaches.</u>

Common Practices and Language

Common design and operation standards are listed below. These are provisions which many or most jurisdictions include in their ordinances.

Trash	Owner is required to provide receptacles for and collect and
	dispose of trash

Liability Insurance	Owner is required to carry liability insurance	
•	Owner is required to carry liability insurance	
Posted Information	Various safety, information and contact info is required to be	
	posted inside, often property manager's contact, but can include	
	relevant ordinances or waste disposal information	
Owner/Operator Proximity	Property manager is required to be within some reasonable and	
	defined distance of the unit	
Parking	Minimum, off-street parking requirements	
Faxes Places the tax responsibility on the owner/operator		
Timeframe	Rentals are limited to 30 days or less	
Zoning Compliance Permits	Zoning permits required for short-term rental land use	
Occupancy and/or Gathering Limits	Limits on the number of occupants or visitors to the site, most	
	often when located in residential areas	
Cooking Many prohibit cooking in bedrooms		

Zoning Districts

Most localities limit, restrict, or prohibit STRs in various districts through their Permitted Use table. Where permitted by-right, many localities have a "use-by-right with additional requirements" category. Most localities prohibit STRs in residential districts.

Owner-Occupied/Homestays vs. Whole-Home/Dedicated Short-Term Rentals

There is an important distinction between owner-occupied homestays and whole-home dedicated STRs. These two kinds of STR are sometimes considered separate uses based on locality. For example, **Asheville** and **Boone** distinguish between homestays and non-owner-occupied STRs and have standards for each. **Sylva** limits STRs to accessory uses where the primary use is an owner-occupied residence or long-term rental. **Chapel Hill** distinguishes between primary residence STRs and dedicated STRs; the former differs from homestays in that there is no provision requiring the owner to be on-site during the rental period but only that the unit be their primary residence. In communities that take this approach, it is often difficult to police and enforce the nuances of homestays versus whole-home STRs.

Localities

LOCATION	STR STANDARD
Sylva, NC	In August 2022, Sylva redefined STRs as an accessory use provided the primary use is owner-occupied or a long-term rental. Requires that outdoor signage be no greater than 2 square feet and list the manager's name and 24-hour number. Requires the noise ordinance and waste disposal process, schedule, and routes to be posted conspicuously.
Highlands, NC	Notable for involved parties. The board sought amortization (a method requiring the termination of a nonconforming use within a specific time period) of existing STRs but encountered resistance including opposition from Institute for Justice firm, which won the Wilmington case. A text amendment passed on 9/15/22 which grandfathered STRs as nonconforming uses and required that the ordinance standards be posted in the rental unit.

Pinehurst, NC	Village Council recently voted to prohibit new STRs in residential districts and require			
	existing ones to get a Zoning Certificate and be classified as a legal, nonconforming			
	use.			
Chapel Hill, NC	Dedicated STRs are not allowed in residential districts but are allowed in mixed-use			
	districts. Owner-occupied STRs are allowed in neighborhoods based on certain			
	residency criteria.			
Asheville, NC Asheville discerns between short-term vacation rentals (STVRs) and homesta				
	defining each as a commercial lodging use. <i>Homestays</i> are permitted only in the			
	conditional-zoning-only Expansion (EXP) district and are classified as a "use by right			
	subject to special requirements" (USSR) for most other districts, including all			
	Residential districts. STVRs are permitted by right in two conditional zoning districts			
	and as USSR in the resort district; they are not allowed anywhere else, including			
	residential.			
Black Mountain,	Black Mountain, The Town Council recently directed staff to draft life, safety, and permitting			
NC				
	inspection, and tax reporting if not using a management company or online rental			
	booking site; Units required to have functional smoke and CO2 detectors, bear-proof			
	trash cans, sufficient off-street guest parking spaces, an emergency ladder in upper			
	story bedrooms, and posting of public safety and non-emergency numbers, garbage			
	and recycling information, and noise ordinance requirements on the site; A local			
	owner or property manager must live within 60 miles of the rental unit, and their			
	contact information must be posted in the unit and on file with the town.			
Charleston, SC	Charleston recognizes two types of STR: residential and commercial. Both are			
	permitted as conditional uses. Commercial use is subject to an overlay district.			
	Residential is owner-occupied only and requires a 15-day notice to neighbors about			
	the STR application process; concerns must be addressed prior to approval.			
Chattanooga, TN	The city allows homestays in limited areas and allows whole-house STRs in the			
	commercial districts.			
Jackson Hole, WY	STRs are only allowed in the Lodging Overlay District. The ordinance is framed as			
	protecting the tourism economy and community from low-quality rentals. 300 ft			
	neighbor notices are required. Unpermitted STR operator/owners are not allowed to			
	operate a STR for 5 years from the date of the violation.			
Santa Fe, NM	Notable for comparable tourism economy and variety of unique regulations. Santa Fe			
	caps the number of STRs at a maximum of 1,000 STRs on residential property. There			
	is a 50-foot spacing minimum between STRs and a 25% unit cap up to 12 STR permits			
	in multifamily developments. The owner must be able to arrive on-site within an hour			
	of receiving a complaint and keep 3 years of records. Units may only be rented once			
	in a 7-day period. Neighbors within 200 feet of a permitted STR must be notified			
	within 10 days of permit issuance.			

PROPOSED TEXT AMENDMENTS

The following table summarizes the proposed Zoning Ordinance Text Amendments related to Short-term Rentals, and the associated Comprehensive Plan section related to the changes.

SUMMARY OF PROPOSED TEXT AMENDMENTS		PLANNNING BOARD REVIEW	COMP PLAN SECTION	
1	Limit the use of dwelling units for the purpose of short-term rentals or grouped complexes of STRs to commercial zoning districts (NS, CS, EMP, PS, CR). In Open Use District, allow grouped complexes of STRs as a Special Use Permit (<i>SEC 78-641 Permitted</i> <i>Uses.</i>)		GEC - Policy 7: Increase housing options and improve housing affordability for all residents.	
2	Change the definition of short-term rental to allow only single- family detached units to be rented short-term.		GEC - Action 4: Expand and protect affordable and accessible housing choices. Support a mix of housing	
3	Lower the maximum gross floor area that a single unit can be for a short-term rental. (SEC 78-581 Definitions.)			
4	Clarify the definition of a short-term rental to state that it includes those which are rented for a minimum of two days and no greater than 30 days. (SEC 78-581 Definitions.)		types within growth areas to accommodate the projected demand for long-term rental	
5	Create Special Requirement (SR) standards for short-term rentals in the commercial areas where they are allowed. Standards include parking, spacing, limits on events, waste management,		and owner-occupied housing GEC - Action 5: Consider the	
	signage, owner/operator distance from unit, access standards, permitting requirements, and fire safety. (SEC 78-678 Uses by right subject to special requirements and special use standards.)		utilization of available tools to mitigate the loss of year-	
6	Provide a zoning permit process to grant legal, non-conforming status to pre-existing short-term rentals to allow them to remain in operation. (SEC 78-657 Nonconforming Uses.)		round housing to short-term rentals.	
7	To maintain legal, non-conforming status the structure must be rented as a short-term rental for a minimum of two nights every 180 days. (SEC 78-657 Nonconforming Uses.)		ECON. DEV., EDUCATION, AND JOBS - Policy 2: Provide adequate housing options for	
8	Indicate that an existing non-conforming short-term rental that is transferred by deed shall end the grandfathering status of the use for a short-term rental. (SEC 78-657 Nonconforming Uses.)		all income levels to meet the needs of economic development opportunities.	
9	Prohibit short-term rentals in Manufactured Home Parks (SEC 78- 678 Uses by right subject to special requirements and special use standards.)		GEC - Policy 7: Explore protections for existing affordable housing, with a particular emphasis on	
10	Prohibit short-term rentals in developments that receive a county incentive, such as a PUD, COD, density bonus program, etc.			
11	Create a definition of detached structure.		manufactured housing parks	

TIMELINE

- November 2023 Staff held internal technical meetings with County Departments regarding the proposed amendments.
- December 1, 2023 Memo provided to Planning Board
- December 18, 2023 Staff presentation of proposed amendments to Planning Board. A large number of
 residents wished to provide comments regarding the proposed amendments. The Planning Board asked staff
 to provide a large space for a night meeting to provide residents with an opportunity to provide feedback on
 the proposed amendments.