February 1, 2022

Mr. Ron Venturella
Procurement Manager
Buncombe County
Finance
200 College St., 4th Floor
Asheville, North Carolina 28802

Subject: Buncombe County
Solid Waste Management Facility
Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C&D Landfill) Construction Project
Bid Evaluation and Recommendation

Dear Mr. Venturella:

Bids were received by Buncombe County for the above referenced project on Thursday, January 20, 2022 at 3:00 PM. A total of three (3) bids were received and opened. This letter presents a bid evaluation and recommendation for award by SCS Engineers, PC (SCS). The certified bid tabulation is attached for your reference.

The project was bid with a Total Base Bid. The overall project construction involves:

- Cell 7 – Construction of an approximately 13.5-acre Subtitle D Landfill expansion complete with a composite bottom liner system, a leachate collection system, and appurtenances, including but not limited to clearing and grubbing, erosion and sediment control, excavation and backfill, seeding and mulching, storm drainage, and perimeter access road construction.

- Phase 7 – Construction of an approximately 5.5-acre C&D Landfill expansion, including but not limited to clearing and grubbing, erosion and sediment control, excavation and backfill, landfill soil base, seeding and mulching, storm drainage, and access road construction.

EVALUATION OF BIDS

As mentioned, three (3) bids were received and opened. SCS evaluated each bid based on whether the Contractor submitted all information as required by Specification Sections 00100 and 00300 of the bid documents. A matrix is attached as **Exhibit 1** showing bidders, the information required in the bid, and a summary of the bid amounts. The matrix shows that Morgan Corp. did not include a fully executed Section 00480, Non-Collusive Affidavit, as part of their bid. Sargent Corporation and Thalle Construction Co., Inc. submitted all required information.

Each bid was reviewed for mathematical errors and other discrepancies. The bid from Morgan Corp. contained discrepancies between their written Totals and the Totals calculated by SCS. The following are discrepancies for specific line items presented in Morgan Corp. bid:

- Bid Line Item No. 27 Total was presented to be $33,500.00. SCS calculated the total to be $333,500.00 or $300,000.00 higher than Morgan Corp.'s total.

- Bid Line Item No. 48 Total was presented to be $344,100.00. SCS calculated the total to be $341,000.00 or $3,100.00 lower than Morgan Corp.'s total.

- Bid Line Item No. 55 Total was presented to be $730,000.00. The unit cost in figures and words was $720,000.00.

Per line item discrepancies calculated by SCS, and based on the General Conditions, which state that the unit cost governs, the project Subtotals and Totals are revised to the following:

- The Project Subtotal (Items 1 through 61) was presented to be $14,107,501.00. SCS calculated the total to be $14,104,401.00 or $3,397.00 lower than Morgan Corp.'s total.

- Bid Line Item No. 62 was presented to be $632,125.00. SCS calculated the total to be $705,220.05 or $73,095.05 higher than Morgan Corp.'s total.

- The Total Base Bid was presented to be $14,739,626.00. SCS calculated the total to be $14,809,621.05 or $69,995.05 higher than Morgan Corp.'s total.

- No other errors were recorded.

Exhibit 2 presents a detailed certified bid tabulation for the Total Base Bid. The bids are as follows from low to high:

1)	Sargent Corporation	$ 12,320,348.25
2)	Thalle Construction Co., Inc.	$ 12,645,879.75
3)	Morgan Corp.	$ 14,739,626.00

The corrected Total Base Bids are as follows from low to high:

1)	Sargent Corporation	$ 12,320,348.25
2)	Thalle Construction Co., Inc.	$ 12,645,879.75
3)	Morgan Corp.	$ 14,809,621.05

RECOMMENDATION

Provided the County determines that Sargent Construction is in compliance with the Minority Business Plan Compliance Requirements as set forth in the Project Specifications and as determined by your office, and the County has no questions or comments regarding the information provided herein, SCS recommends Sargent Construction as the low responsive bidder and that Buncombe County award the contract for the Buncombe County Solid Waste Management Facility, Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C&D Landfill) Construction Project to Sargent Construction.

SCS appreciates the opportunity to continue to assist Buncombe County with its solid waste management program. If you have questions or need any additional information, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Please do not hesitate to contact me at (919) 397-5863 if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Kenton J. Yang, PE
Project Director
SCS Engineers, PC

Jarrod Timmons, EI
Project Professional
SCS Engineers, PC

Exhibit 1 - Bid Summary

Buncombe County, North Carolina
Buncombe County Solid Waste Facility
Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C/D Landfill) Construction Project

Contractor	Contractor License Number	Addendum Nos. 1-4	MBE (Section 00310)	Bid Security Forms (Section 00410)	Non-Collusive Affidavit (Section 00480)	Authority to Execute Contract (Section 00485)	Bid Form (Section 00300) Base Bid
Morgan Corp.	12289	✓	✓	✓		✓	$ 14,739,626.00
Sargent Corporation	65779	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	$ 12,320,348.25
Thalle Construction Co., Inc.	35203	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	$ 12,645,879.75

Bid Evaluation Notes:

1. Morgan Corp. did not include a fully executed Section 00480, Non-Collusive Affidavit, as part of their bid.

Exhibit 2 - Bid Tabulation

Buncombe County, North Carolina
Buncombe County Solid Waste Facility
Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C/D Landfill) Construction Project

PHASE 7 (C&D LANDFILL) - BID FORM

START OF PHASE 7 (C&D LANDFILL) BID FORM

Item	Item Description	Units	Scheduled Quantity	Morgan Corp.		Sargent Corporation		Thalle Construction Co., Inc.	
				Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
1	Clearing and Grubbing	AC	9.5	$ 7,800.00	$ 74,100.00	$ 9,000.00	$ 85,500.00	$ 7,500.00	$ 71,250.00
2	Removal of Vegetation and Topsoil	AC	9.5	$ 11,600.00	$ 110,200.00	$ 5,900.00	$ 56,050.00	$ 6,500.00	$ 61,750.00
3	Excavate, Haul, and Stockpile of Soil Material in Borrow Area	CY	50,400	$ 5.40	$ 272,160.00	$ 7.00	$ 352,800.00	$ 6.00	$ 302,400.00
4	Excavate, Haul and Backfill of Soil Material in Phase 7 Expansion Area	CY	12,600	$ 7.30	$ 91,980.00	$ 5.00	$ 63,000.00	$ 6.00	$ 75,600.00
5	Excavate Rippable Rock	CY	1,200	$ 15.00	$ 18,000.00	$ 15.00	$ 18,000.00	$ 8.00	$ 9,600.00
6	Excavate Non-Rippable Rock	CY	300	$ 46.00	$ 13,800.00	$ 75.00	$ 22,500.00	$ 25.00	$ 7,500.00
7	Undercut and Stockpile Unsuitable Materials and Backfill Undercut Area with Suitable Soils	CY	6,000	$ 12.20	$ 73,200.00	$ 8.00	$ 48,000.00	$ 10.00	$ 60,000.00
8	Furnish and Install French Drain	LF	1,200	$ 130.00	$ 156,000.00	$ 80.00	$ 96,000.00	$ 60.00	$ 72,000.00
9	Furnish and Install 24-Inch Crushed Stone Perimeter Access Roadway	SY	6,800	$ 55.00	$ 374,000.00	$ 40.00	$ 272,000.00	$ 50.00	$ 340,000.00
10	Furnish and Install Guardrail	LF	1,700	$ 49.00	$ 83,300.00	$ 42.00	$ 71,400.00	$ 32.50	$ 55,250.00
11	Furnish and Install Sediment and Erosion Control	LS	1	$ 865,000.00	$ 865,000.00	$ 600,000.00	$ 600,000.00	$ 400,000.00	$ 400,000.00
12	Furnish and Install Permanent Seeding and Mulching	SY	31,600	$ 0.47	$ 14,852.00	$ 0.50	$ 15,800.00	$ 0.75	$ 23,700.00

END OF PHASE 7 (C&D LANDFILL) BID FORM

Buncombe County, North Carolina
Buncombe County Solid Waste Facility
Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C/D Landfill) Construction Project

START OF CELL 7 (MSW LANDFILL) BID FORM										
Item	Item Description	Units	Scheduled Quantity	Morgan Corp.		Sargent Corporation		Thalle Construction Co., Inc.	
				Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
	SURFACE PREPARATION								
13	Clearing and Grubbing	AC	33.2	$ 7,800.00	$ 258,960.00	$ 9,000.00	$ 298,800.00	$ 7,500.00	$ 249,000.00
14	Removal of Vegetation and Topsoil	AC	28.1	$ 10,800.00	$ 303,480.00	$ 5,900.00	$ 165,790.00	$ 6,500.00	$ 182,650.00
	EARTHWORK								
15	Excavate, Haul, and Stockpile of Soil Material in Borrow Area	CY	108,600	$ 5.40	$ 586,440.00	$ 7.00	$ 760,200.00	$ 7.50	$ 814,500.00
16	Excavate, Haul and Backfill of Soil Material for Cell 7, Anchor Berms and Roads	CY	112,200	$ 5.10	$ 572,220.00	$ 5.00	$ 561,000.00	$ 7.60	$ 852,720.00
17	Excavate Rippable Rock	CY	4,700	$ 15.00	$ 70,500.00	$ 15.00	$ 70,500.00	$ 8.00	$ 37,600.00
18	Excavate Non-Rippable Rock	CY	1,200	$ 46.00	$ 55,200.00	$ 75.00	$ 90,000.00	$ 25.00	$ 30,000.00
19	Undercut and Stockpile Unsuitable Materials and Backfill Undercut Area with Suitable Soils	CY	25,800	$ 11.00	$ 283,800.00	$ 8.00	$ 206,400.00	$ 10.00	$ 258,000.00
20	Furnish and Install French Drain	LF	1,000	$ 130.00	$ 130,000.00	$ 80.00	$ 80,000.00	$ 35.00	$ 35,000.00
	BASE LINER SYSTEM								
21	Furnish and Install 18-inch Compacted Soil Liner Material	SY	66,700	$ 7.30	$ 486,910.00	$ 6.00	$ 400,200.00	$ 5.00	$ 333,500.00
22	Furnish and Install Geosynthetic Clay Liner	SY	66,700	$ 10.00	$ 667,000.00	$ 6.00	$ 400,200.00	$ 7.00	$ 466,900.00
23	Furnish and Install HDPE Geomembrane	SY	66,700	$ 9.20	$ 613,640.00	$ 6.00	$ 400,200.00	$ 7.00	$ 466,900.00
24	Furnish and Install Fabric Cushion	SY	66,700	$ 7.25	$ 483,575.00	$ 5.50	$ 366,850.00	$ 7.00	$ 466,900.00
25	Furnish and Install Cells 6 to 7 Liner System Connection	LF	1,000	$ 27.00	$ 27,000.00	$ 20.00	$ 20,000.00	$ 20.00	$ 20,000.00
26	Furnish and Install 24-inch Thick Rock Protective Cover Layer	SY	100	$ 58.00	$ 5,800.00	$ 50.00	$ 5,000.00	$ 30.00	$ 3,000.00
27	Haul and Install 24-inch Thick Rock Protective Cover Layer	SY	66,700	$ 5.00	$ 333,500.00	$ 4.00	$ 266,800.00	$ 5.00	$ 333,500.00

Buncombe County, North Carolina
Buncombe County Solid Waste Facility
Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C/D Landfill) Construction Project

CELL 7 (MSW LANDFILL) - BID FORM

	PIPING										
28	Furnish and Install 10-inch Perforated HDPE Leachate Collection Pipe	LF	2,600	$ 120.00	$ 312,000.00	$ 80.00	$ 208,000.00	$ 100.00	$ 260,000.00
29	Furnish and Install 10-inch Solid HDPE Leachate Collection Pipe	LF	700	$ 105.00	$ 73,500.00	$ 25.00	$ 17,500.00	$ 100.00	$ 70,000.00
30	Furnish and Install 18-inch Solid HDPE Leachate Collection Pipe	LF	100	$ 235.00	$ 23,500.00	$ 100.00	$ 10,000.00	$ 200.00	$ 20,000.00
31	Furnish and Install 24-inch Perforated HDPE Leachate Collection Pipe	LF	400	$ 405.00	$ 162,000.00	$ 250.00	$ 100,000.00	$ 300.00	$ 120,000.00
32	Furnish and Install 24-inch Solid HDPE Gas Header	LF	2,200	$ 245.00	$ 539,000.00	$ 140.00	$ 308,000.00	$ 150.00	$ 330,000.00
33	Furnish and Install 1-inch Solid HDPE Air Line	LF	2,200	$ 22.00	$ 48,400.00	$ 10.00	$ 22,000.00	$ 6.00	$ 13,200.00
34	Furnish and Install 6-inch Solid HDPE Leachate Forcemain and Recirculation Pipe	LF	1,200	$ 52.00	$ 62,400.00	$ 35.00	$ 42,000.00	$ 35.00	$ 42,000.00
	CONDENSATE RECOVERY SYSTEM								
35	Furnish and Install Condensate Recovery System	LS	1	$ 105,000.00	$ 105,000.00	$ 50,000.00	$ 50,000.00	$ 150,000.00	$ 150,000.00
	LEACHATE PUMP STATION								
36	Furnish and Install Submersible Leachate Pump Station (Complete) with all Appurtenances	LS	1	$ 250,000.00	$ 250,000.00	$ 500,000.00	$ 500,000.00	$ 150,000.00	$ 150,000.00
37	Remove, Replace and Improve Existing Cells 1 through 6 Leachate Pump Stations	EA	6	$ 28,000.00	$ 168,000.00	$ 30,000.00	$ 180,000.00	$ 30,000.00	$ 180,000.00
	GROUNDWATER MONITORING SYSTEM								
38	Furnish and Install Groundwater Monitoring System (Complete)	LS	1	$ 175,000.00	$ 175,000.00	$ 300,000.00	$ 300,000.00	$ 200,000.00	$ 200,000.00
	JET CLEAN AND VIDEO								
39	Jet Clean New HDPE Piping	LF	9,000	$ 7.25	$ 65,250.00	$ 1.00	$ 9,000.00	$ 2.00	$ 18,000.00
40	Video Camera Inspect New Leachate Collection HDPE Piping	LF	3,600	$ 7.25	$ 26,100.00	$ 1.00	$ 3,600.00	$ 2.00	$ 7,200.00
41	Jet Clean Existing Leachate Collection HDPE Piping	LF	5,800	$ 7.25	$ 42,050.00	$ 1.00	$ 5,800.00	$ 2.00	$ 11,600.00
42	Video Camera Inspect Existing Leachate Collection HDPE Piping	LF	5,800	$ 7.25	$ 42,050.00	$ 1.00	$ 5,800.00	$ 2.00	$ 11,600.00

Buncombe County, North Carolina
Buncombe County Solid Waste Facility
Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C/D Landfill) Construction Project

	PRECAST CONCRETE STRUCTURES AND REINFORCED CONCRETE PIPE (RCP)									
43	Furnish and Install Drop Inlet Structures (Complete)	EA	2	$ 9,100.00	$ 18,200.00	$ 10,000.00	$ 20,000.00	$ 25,000.00	$ 50,000.00
44	Furnish and Install Concrete Stilling Structure (Complete)	LS	1	$ 17,000.00	$ 17,000.00	$ 7,000.00	$ 7,000.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 3,000.00
45	Furnish and Install 24-inch RCP	LF	320	$ 130.00	$ 41,600.00	$ 120.00	$ 38,400.00	$ 100.00	$ 32,000.00
	LANDFILL ROADS AND RAMP									
46	Furnish and Install 12-Inch Crushed Stone Perimeter Access Roadway	SY	6,000	$ 33.00	$ 198,000.00	$ 20.00	$ 120,000.00	$ 50.00	$ 300,000.00
1 47	Furnish and Install Asphalt Paved Access Road	SY	3,100	$ 109.00	$ 337,900.00	$ 80.00	$ 248,000.00	$ 60.00	$ 186,000.00
48	Remove Existing Crushed Stone Surface and Furnish and Install Asphalt Paved Access Road	SY	3,100	$ 110.00	$ 341,000.00	$ 70.00	$ 217,000.00	$ 65.00	$ 201,500.00
49	Furnish and Install Guardrail	LF	1,900	$ 49.00	$ 93,100.00	$ 40.00	$ 76,000.00	$ 32.50	$ 61,750.00
50	Furnish and Install Landfill Access Ramp	LS	1	$ 350,000.00	$ 350,000.00	$ 200,000.00	$ 200,000.00	$ 300,000.00	$ 300,000.00
	SEDIMENT AND EROSION AND STORMWATER CONTROL									
51	Furnish and Install Riprap Lined Drainage Channel	LF	2,500	$ 135.00	$ 337,500.00	$ 100.00	$ 250,000.00	$ 150.00	$ 375,000.00
52	Re-establish Riprap Lined Drainage Channel	LF	1,200	$ 95.00	$ 114,000.00	$ 100.00	$ 120,000.00	$ 55.00	$ 66,000.00
53	Furnish and Install Sediment and Erosion Control	LS	1	$ 430,000.00	$ 430,000.00	$ 500,000.00	$ 500,000.00	$ 250,000.00	$ 250,000.00
54	Furnish and Install Stormwater Diversion Berms for Cell 6 Runoff	LF	2,800	$ 30.00	$ 84,000.00	$ 45.00	$ 126,000.00	$ 10.00	$ 28,000.00
55	Furnish and Install Cell 7 Stormwater Segregation System	LS	1	$ 720,000.00	$ 720,000.00	$ 350,000.00	$ 350,000.00	$ 550,000.00	$ 550,000.00
	SEEDING AND MULCHING									
56	Furnish and Install Temporary Seeding and Mulching	SY	58,100	$ 0.47	$ 27,307.00	$ 0.25	$ 14,525.00	$ 0.50	$ 29,050.00
57	Furnish and Install Permanent Seeding and Mulching	SY	58,100	$ 0.67	$ 38,927.00	$ 0.50	$ 29,050.00	$ 0.75	$ 43,575.00

Buncombe County, North Carolina
Buncombe County Solid Waste Facility
Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C/D Landfill) Construction Project

	ELECTRICAL CONNECTIONS AND APPURTENANCES									
58	Furnish and Install all Electrical Connections and Appurtenances	LS	1	$ 340,000.00	$ 340,000.00	$ 300,000.00	$ 300,000.00	$ 250,000.00	$ 250,000.00
	TESTING									
59	Complete Geomembrane Leak Location Survey	LS	1	$ 32,000.00	$ 32,000.00	$ 25,000.00	$ 25,000.00	$ 25,000.00	$ 25,000.00
	END OF CELL 7 (MSW LANDFILL) BID FORM									
	PHASE 7 (C&D LANDFILL) SUBTOTAL (ITEMS 1 THROUGH 12)				$ 2,146,592.00		$ 1,701,050.00		$ 1,479,050.00
	CELL 7 (MSW LANDFILL) SUBTOTAL (ITEMS 13 THROUGH 59)				$ 10,492,809.00		$ 8,494,615.00		$ 8,884,645.00
	PROJECT SUBTOTAL (ITEMS 1 THROUGH 59)				$ 12,639,401.00		$ 10,195,665.00		$ 10,363,695.00

	PROJECT-LEVEL ITEMS - BID FORM									
Item	**Item Description**	**Units**	**Scheduled Quantity**	**Morgan Corp.**		**Sargent Corporation**		**Thalle Construction Co., Inc.**	
				Unit Price	**Amount**	**Unit Price**	**Amount**	**Unit Price**	**Amount**
60	Miscellaneous Work and Clean-up	LS	1	$ 365,000.00	$ 365,000.00	$ 738,000.00	$ 738,000.00	$ 1,130,000.00	$ 1,130,000.00
61	Mobilization and De-mobilization	LS	1	$ 1,100,000.00	$ 1,100,000.00	$ 800,000.00	$ 800,000.00	$ 550,000.00	$ 550,000.00
	PROJECT-LEVEL ITEMS - BID FORM									
	PROJECT SUBTOTAL (ITEMS 1 THROUGH 61)				$ 14,104,401.00		$ 11,733,665.00		$ 12,043,695.00
62	5% Contingency Allowance (on Project Subtotal)				$ 705,220.05		$ 586,683.25		$ 602,184.75
	TOTAL BASE BID (ITEMS 1 THROUGH 62)				**$ 14,809,621.05**		**$ 12,320,348.25**		**$ 12,645,879.75**

Exhibit 2 - Bid Tabulation

Buncombe County, North Carolina
Buncombe County Solid Waste Facility
Cell 7 (MSW Landfill) and Phase 7 (C/D Landfill) Construction Project

BID ALTERNATE										
Item	Item Description	Units	Scheduled Quantity	Morgan Corp.		Sargent Corporation		Thalle Construction Co., Inc.	
				Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
63	Delete Riprap Lined Drainage Channel from Bid Item No. 51 and Furnish and Install Fabric-filled Concrete Lined Drainage Channel	LF	2,500	$ 220.00	$ 550,000.00	$ 190.00	$ 475,000.00	$ 140.00	$ 350,000.00
	SUBTOTAL BID ALTERNATE (ITEMS 1 - 50, 52 - 61 and 63)				$ 14,316,901.00		$ 11,958,665.00		$ 12,018,695.00
64	5% Contingency Allowance (on Subtotal Bid Alternate)				$ 715,845.05		$ 597,933.25		$ 600,934.75
	TOTAL BID ALTERNATE (ITEMS 1 - 50, 52 - 61, 63 and 64)				**$ 15,032,746.05**		**$ 12,556,598.25**		**$ 12,619,629.75**

BID TABULATION WAS PREPARED BY ME OR UNDER MY DIRECT SUPERVISION.

Kenton J. Yang, PE

02-01-2022